

OPINION

by James Borislavov Jolovski, Associate Professor at the Higher School of Insurance and Finance, PhD in Economics

of a dissertation for the award of the educational and scientific degree "**doctor (PhD)**"

in the field of higher education 3. Social, economic and legal sciences

Professional field 3.8. Economics

doctoral program "*Finance, Insurance and Assurance*"

Author : *Angelcho Andonovski*

Topic : **The role of marketing in creating financial resources in healthcare organizations**

Scientific supervisor : Prof. D.Sc. Mariela Deliverska , VUZF

1. General description of the materials presented

By order No. 696 of 16.12.2024 of the Rector of the Higher School of Insurance and Finance, Prof. D. Sc. Boris Velchev, I am appointed as a member of the scientific jury to participate in a procedure for the defense of a dissertation on the topic The Role of Marketing in the Creation of Financial Resources in Healthcare Organizations for the acquisition of the educational and scientific degree "Doctor (PhD)" in Field of higher education 3. Social, economic and legal sciences, Professional field 3.8. Economics, doctoral program "Finance, Insurance and Provision". The author of the dissertation is Angelcho Andonovski – PhD student in independent study at the department "Finance and Insurance" with scientific supervisor Prof. D. Sc. Mariela Deliverska, VUZF.

The materials submitted by Angelcho Andonovski include documents according to the presented list: dissertation, abstract, declaration of originality, reference for the fulfillment of the minimum national requirements, list of publications, publications on the topic of the dissertation, summaries of publications and autobiography.

The doctoral student has submitted 3 articles, two of which were published in the Macedonian International Journal of Marketing (ISSN 1857-9787) and one article – in the Journal of the Institute of Economics (ISSN 1409-7893)

2. Brief biographical data about the doctoral student

Angelcho Andonovski was born in 1976 and lives and works in the Republic of North Macedonia. He obtained his Master's degree in Medicine in 2016 at the University of St. Cyril and Methodius in the Republic of North Macedonia. His professional experience includes positions in the field of pharmaceutical sales, medicine and management of healthcare facilities. As can be seen from the candidate's education and professional experience, he has knowledge and skills in the field of healthcare, sales and management, which guarantee his ability to independently develop a dissertation. As far as I do not know Angelcho Andonovski personally, all of the above is based on information in the provided resume.

3. Relevance of the topic and appropriateness of the set goals and objectives

The relevance and significance of the study are indicated by the author in "Social Justice for Studying the Topic". In my opinion, the doctoral student could argue them in a more explicit way. However, this topic is undoubtedly relevant, since in recent years we have observed numerous trends related to various innovations in marketing. At the same time, the importance of healthcare is increasing. On the one hand, this is a consequence of the progress of medicine and its results, leading to an increase in life expectancy. On the other hand, there are global events such as the COVID-19 pandemic, which have posed unprecedented challenges to healthcare systems and medical institutions.

4. Knowledge of the problem

It is evident from the candidate's professional experience that he is familiar with the issues in the field of healthcare and sales. He also demonstrates a good knowledge of literary sources, having indicated 123 different ones, which are diverse in their nature. The text in essence, as well as the presented and analyzed trends, also confirm these statements.

5. Research methodology

The research methodology is presented in the introduction – on page 12. It includes historical method, content analysis, comparative analysis, statistical method and synthesis. The candidate has indicated for the implementation of which research task each of the indicated methods was used.

The time frame of the study is also defined, which represents a kind of limitation. The data used is up to 2022, and the author could include more current ones in view of the expectation that the dissertation will present the most up-to-date trends possible.

6. Characteristics and evaluation of the dissertation work

The dissertation has a total volume of 213 pages, consisting of an introduction, four chapters, a conclusion, scientific contributions and a bibliography. The main text consists of approximately 193 pages. Overall, consistent and logically correct connections have been established between the individual structural elements.

In my opinion, the formulated subject of the study could be refined. A more explicit formulation of the object of the study is necessary. At the same time, the goals and objectives of the study are not clearly presented. However, two special hypotheses and one supporting are defined.

The first chapter is entitled "Marketing of Values and Consumer Engagement in Healthcare". It is entirely theoretical in nature, presenting in five points to a significant extent already known facts and characteristics about marketing and its functions. A specific emphasis, however, is on marketing in the context of healthcare. The sixth point is a critical analysis of the literature on the application of marketing in healthcare. The formulation of conclusions and a summary can be accepted as a positive approach. However, the critical analysis itself implies a more strongly expressed author's opinion. This approach contributes to the construction of logical connections between the structural elements.

Chapter Two is entitled Developing a Consumer-Driven Healthcare Marketing Strategy. The chapter moves from a theoretical to a more practical focus. However, to some extent, it also presents common knowledge. The chapter examines research on the application of healthcare marketing, commenting on specific empirical data. Case studies are also presented – Babylon Health, Peloton, Health Essentials etc. The next part of the chapter also discusses case studies – Centura Health, Arkansas Children's Hospital and Cleveland Clinic. The chapter concludes by outlining and designing the main innovations in the healthcare sector.

The third chapter is entitled "Preparation of an integrated marketing plan and program in healthcare". It has a theoretical-applied nature, without analyzing empirical data. At the same time, the author's opinion is expressed with specific assessments and recommendations of existing practices or in connection with the implementation of innovations. The fourth chapter is called "Achieving consumer value in healthcare". It has a similar nature to the third chapter.

After the fourth chapter, a Conclusion is positioned, which summarizes the conclusions formulated at the end of each chapter. The scientific contributions are presented in a separate structural element.

Some individual views of the candidate do not fully correspond to my personal understanding. However, they are sufficiently motivated in the dissertation. For this reason, I could not accept that this circumstance has any bearing on the merits of the proposed scientific research.

7. Contributions and significance of the development for science and practice

The candidate's views on the implemented attempts at scientific contributions are separated into a separate structural element - "Use of scientific and practical results". Six contributions are indicated, which are relatively well formulated. However, in my opinion, they are too general and should be more specifically expressed. Only one of the contributions is based on the study of empirical data - part of the dissertation, which I find not entirely sufficient in volume. The contributions could be summarized so as to reduce their number, but to emphasize to a greater extent the most valuable achievements and merits of the author. Despite the considerations stated, I believe that the work is characterized by scientific and applied contributions.

8. Assessment of dissertation publications

Three independent publications in English have been published on the topic of the dissertation – two of which were published in the Macedonian International Journal of Marketing and one article – in Journal of the Institute of Economics .

9. Assessment of compliance with minimum national requirements

The candidate has submitted 3 independent publications, each of which brings him 10 points. In this way, he earns the required minimum of 30 points. The submitted dissertation carries 50 points. In view of these considerations, it can be concluded that the minimum national requirements established by the LDARSB and the regulations for its implementation have been met.

10. Personal participation of the doctoral student

I have no doubt about the personal participation of the doctoral student in the development of the dissertation. His professional experience is a sufficient basis on which he has built skills for conducting independent scientific research. I believe that the presented contributions are his personal merit.

11. Autor's abstract

An abstract in Bulgarian and English is presented in a volume of 46 pages. In my opinion, it successfully recreates the main highlights of the work (including the contributions). The abstract ends

with a declaration of originality. I believe that overall its content meets the standard expectations for material of this nature and complies with the requirements.

12. Critical remarks and recommendations

My critical remarks and recommendations are presented above for the relevant structural elements of the work. I have no additional ones beyond those already mentioned.

13. Personal impressions

I do not know the candidate personally and have no other impressions than those gained from the materials provided in connection with the defense procedure.

14. Recommendations for future use of the dissertation contributions and results

I recommend that the candidate extends his research on the future of healthcare, focusing on the various innovations in its marketing and analyzing their practical application.

CONCLUSION

The dissertation work *contains scientific, scientifically-applied and applied results, which represent an original contribution to science* and meet the requirements of the LDARSB and the regulations for its implementation. The presented materials and dissertation results comply with the specific requirements of the internal rules of VUZF.

The dissertation shows that the doctoral student Angelcho Andonovski possesses sufficient theoretical knowledge and professional skills in Professional Field 3.8. Economics, demonstrating qualities and skills for independent conduct of scientific research.

In view of the above, I give *a positive assessment* of the conducted research in the reviewed dissertation, the achieved results and contributions, and *I propose to the esteemed scientific jury to award* Angelcho Andonovski the *educational and scientific degree 'doctor (PhD)'* in the Field of Higher Education 3. Social, Economic and Legal Sciences; Professional Field 3. 8. Economics; Doctoral program "Finance and Insurance"

17.01.2025

Reviewer:

Assoc. Prof. James Jolovski, PhD