

STANDPOINT

by Prof. Christian Anastasov Tanushev, Ph.D.

University of National and World Economy

on a dissertation for awarding the educational and scientific degree "Doctor of Philosophy" (Ph.D.)
in the Field of Higher Education 3. Social, Economic, and Legal Sciences
Professional Area 3.8. Economics

Author: Angelcho Andonovski

**Topic: „The role of marketing in the creation of financial resources
in healthcare organizations”**

1. General Description of the Materials Submitted

By Order No. 687 of 16.12.2024 of the Higher School of Insurance and Finance Rector, Prof. Boris Velchev, DSc, Ph.D. I have been appointed as a member of the scientific jury for ensuring a procedure for defending a dissertation on the topic "The role of marketing in the creation of financial resources in healthcare organizations". Relationship between marketing and finance in current technological solutions used in business management" for the acquisition of the educational and scientific degree "Doctor of Philosophy" (Ph.D.) in the Field of Higher Education 3. Social, Economic, and Legal Sciences, Professional Area 3.8. Economics. The author of the dissertation is Angelcho Andonovski - a doctoral student in an independent form of education.

The materials submitted by Angelcho Andonovski include the following documents: a dissertation thesis in English and its abstract in English and Bulgarian languages, scientific publications on the topic of the dissertation and their summaries, a certificate of fulfillment of the national minimum requirements under the Law on the Development of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria (LDASRB) and the Regulations for its implementation, an autobiography, a declaration of originality and reliability of the dissertation.

The doctoral student has attached a total of three scientific articles in peer-reviewed publications.

2. Brief biographical details of the applicant

According to the submitted biographical information, Angelcho Andonovski graduated in medicine at the University of St. St. Cyril and Methodius University in Skopje in 2000 with a qualification for a general practitioner. He obtained a Master's degree in medicine from the Thracian University in

Stara Zagora in 2003 and a specialization in pediatrics in 2016. Since 2020, he has been a pediatrician in a polyclinic.

The choice of the topic is closely related to the PhD candidate's more than 20 years of practice as a medical representative of pharmaceutical companies and a physician in Skopje.

3. Characteristics and evaluation of the dissertation

The dissertation is 202 pages long. The list of references includes 123 sources. In English are 121 of them. Based on ideas developed in the literature the author forms his point of view and position.

The study is logically structured and is divided into an introduction, four chapters, and a conclusion. Angelcho Andonovski consistently explores the theoretical aspects of the marketing activities of healthcare providers, the formation of the organization's marketing strategy, the development of an integrated marketing plan, and the process of creating value for the consumer in the implementation of the medical service. The content of the individual parts is balanced and allows each of the ideas presented to be developed.

The actuality of the problems that the dissertation explores can be revealed by tracing the polemics in the countries of the European Union and the USA regarding the reforms undertaken in the field of health care. For any objective observer, technological novelty in the sector, innovations in the field of pharmacology, the avalanche increase in healthcare costs, and the role of the patient in the treatment process are trends that require scientific analysis based precisely on the systematic approach that the author applies.

The dissertation is an interdisciplinary study at the intersection of economics, medicine, and the social sciences. The author has a clear objective to develop a conceptual model for the implementation of a marketing methodology based on the assessment of the value of the medical care received by patients. This goal intertwines in a "Gordian knot" the problems of the health status of the population, access to health care and the cost of services, the quality of medical care provided, the evaluation of the performance of hospitals and medical professionals, and the personal perceptions of the patient.

The problems of the management of this process, of the goal setting, organization, motivation, and control of this activity is not and cannot be the subject of study only by medical specialists. They are also analyzed by management experts to create an appropriate organization of the activity, by economists to evaluate the effectiveness of the resources invested, by psychologists to make sense of emotional attitudes and personal doctor-patient contact, and by sociologists on the stratification of social groups and the ethical problems that arise. The author, undoubtedly relying on his many years of experience in this field, has approached his task in a complex manner and has touched upon each of these areas.

The dissertation presents as equal the positions of the different stakeholders in the process of providing medical care - patients, doctors, hospitals, suppliers of medicines, and medical devices. The perspectives, the positions of each of these stakeholders in the process are important in their own right, but even more useful is their unification and juxtaposition to improve the process as a whole. I can only illustrate what has been said by emphasizing that the doctor-patient, doctor-doctor, doctor-hospital, patient/doctor-medication provider relationships have been thoroughly studied to demonstrate the need for improving medical procedures to enhance the quality of medical service. In each case, the factors that influence these relationships are comprehensively examined.

Particular attention is also paid to the modern methods of digital and mobile marketing in the relationship between the participants in the process. Issues of the implementation of digital innovations such as the Internet of Things, big data, machine learning, and artificial intelligence are discussed, redefining the nature of healthcare service and patient perceptions.

At the end of each chapter, the dissertation forms clear conclusions that follow logically from the theoretical propositions and case studies presented, but also challenge the reader to compare the author's position with their own reflections and conclusions.

4. Contributions and significance of the work for science and practice

In the abstract of the dissertation, the doctoral candidate has formulated eight contributions. I believe that they are too fragmented and could be summarized.

I do not accept contributions 7 and 8 as they cannot be verified from the submitted dissertation text. No specific empirical statistics are presented proving research conducted by the author.

In the theoretical aspect, the main contribution of the PhD candidate is the application of the systematic approach to the management of marketing in health care at both levels: health care system and specific health care providers and the proposed model of a system of measures and activities for the implementation of the tools for marketing impact on patients. I would also highlight as a contribution the study of the co-creation of value for the consumer in the provision of medical service by the physician.

A contribution of an applied nature that can be immediately put into practice is the proposal to develop an integrated marketing plan for healthcare institutions.

5. Assessment of the publications on the dissertation work

The doctoral candidate has submitted three independent publications on the topic of the dissertation in English. The articles are published in journals in the Republic of North Macedonia. They reflect stages of the PhD student's work on the topic and promote his ideas.

6. Assessment of the fulfillment of the minimum national requirements

The dissertation and the three independent publications, as also reflected in the submitted statement, prove that the PhD student meets the minimum national requirements, according to Article 2b, paragraphs 2, 3, and 5 of the LDASRB for the acquisition of the educational and scientific degree "Doctor" in the professional field 3.8. Economics.

7. Abstract of the dissertation

The presented abstract in Bulgarian and English correctly reflects the content of the thesis.

8. Critical remarks and recommendations

I recommend that the Ph.D. candidate reconsider the formulation of the contributions in the abstract so that they more accurately reflect the achievements of the dissertation. The conclusions presented in each of the chapters are a good basis for summarizing the results obtained.

The dissertation topic includes the problem of financial resource creation. The author's thesis and future research should also be based on the analysis of statistical data and financial results of specific healthcare institutions.

I also propose to consider the role of regulatory bodies in shaping marketing policy in the healthcare sector. The issue is only vaguely touched upon and needs to be analyzed more thoroughly.

CONCLUSION

The dissertation, the abstract and the submitted publications justify the conclusion that the PhD candidate meets the requirements of the Law for the Development of Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria and the Regulations for the Implementation of the LDASRB and the specific requirements of the Regulations for the Admission and Training of PhD Students at the VUZF University.

I give a positive assessment of the research presented by the above-reviewed dissertation, abstract, results and contributions, and propose to the honorable scientific jury to award the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D.) to Angelcho Andonovski in the Field of Higher Education 3. Social, economic, and legal sciences; Professional field 3. 8. Economics.

15.01. 2024

Reviewer:



Prof. Christian Tanushev, Ph.D.