

Higher School for Insurance and Finance (VUZF University)

REVIEW

by Prof. Mariana Mateeva Petrova, PhD

of dissertation for awarding the scientific degree "Doctor"
in the field of higher education 3. Social, economic, and legal sciences
Professional field 3.8. Economics
PhD program: "Finance, Insurance and Social Security"
Author: **Angelco Andonovski, MSc**
Title: **Role of marketing in the creation of financial resources in healthcare organizations**

1. General description of the presented materials

Following Order No. 696/16.12.2024, the Rector of the Higher School for Insurance and Finance - Professor Boris Velchev, was appointed as a member of the scientific jury for providing a procedure for the defense of a dissertation on the topic of “**Role of marketing in the creation of financial resources in healthcare organizations**” for obtaining the educational and scientific degree "Doctor" in the field of higher education 3. Social, economic, and legal sciences, Professional field 3.8. Economics, the program "Finance, Insurance, and Social Security". The author of the dissertation is **Angelco Andonovski**.

The materials submitted by **Angelco Andonovski** include documents according to the presented inventory: reference for the scientific and scientific-applied contributions in the dissertation; reference for the fulfillment of the minimum national requirements for the acquisition of a degree "Doctor" in professional field 3.8. Economics; dissertation work; summary of professional accomplishments. In addition, the doctoral student submitted 3 publications.

2. Relevance of the topic and expediency of the set goals and objectives

The subject of the doctoral dissertation is improving a patient's health outcomes relative to the cost of care is an aspiration embraced by stakeholders across the health care system, including patients, providers, health plans, employers, and government organizations.

Basic (general) hypothesis:

Value-based health care is a path to achieving the aspirational goals of the Institute for Healthcare Improvement's “triple aim”—improving the patient experience of care, improving the health of populations, and reducing the per capita cost of health care—as well as improving clinician experience, a fourth aim that others have proposed.

First special hypothesis: Patient and clinician experience improvements are described above. Population health only improves when the health outcomes of many individuals improve, which is the focus of value-based health care.

Second special hypothesis: Costs also cumulate from the care provided for individuals. By organizing teams to care for individuals with similar needs, a value-based approach enables expertise and efficiency, rather than rationing, to drive costs down.

Third special hypothesis: Improving value in health care is not an unreachable utopian ideal. Around the globe, health care delivery organizations—in varied payment settings, with an array of regulatory structures and many different care traditions—have demonstrated dramatically better health outcomes for patients, usually at lower overall costs

Auxiliary hypothesis: Health care's general failure to structure around patient needs accounts for its inconvenience and lack of integrated services. Failing to structure for what is common and routine also increases the burden on caregivers, who too often must improvise to solve routine problems.

3. Knowledge of the problem

The author has made an extensive, thorough, and correct analysis of the various issues addressed in the work, allowing for correct conclusions. For the preparation of this publication, the author analyzed 123 source materials (including those in foreign languages), specialized literature on the subject.

4. Research methodology

With a view to the stated purpose of the work and verification of the adopted research hypotheses, the following research methods were adopted: *historical*; *Content analysis*; *comparative method (comparative)*; *statistical method*; *synthesis*.

The author presented the results of the research conducted and interpreted them correctly.

5. Characteristics and evaluation of the dissertation

The dissertation consists of 213 pages, of which 188 are the main text and the literature used to prepare this publication constitutes 123 source items.

The study has an introduction, four chapters, a conclusion, and a bibliography.

Purpose and scope of the study

Value-based health care connects clinicians to their purpose as healers, supports their professionalism, and can be a powerful mechanism to counter clinician burnout. Critics who

characterize value-based health care as underpinning a model of “industrial health care” distort the meaning of the term value, misinterpreting it as focused on cost. Instead, value-based health care’s focus on better health outcomes aligns clinicians with their patients.

Chapter one: Value marketing and consumer engagement in healthcare focuses on the healthcare marketing process. This is a strategic approach designed to attract healthcare consumers, guide them through their use of healthcare, and keep them engaged in the healthcare system. Healthcare marketing refers to the process by which healthcare professionals use strategic communication to satisfy their customers – patients by guiding them into recovery and maintaining close contact with them.

Chapter two explores multilateral developing a consumer-driven healthcare marketing strategy. It is of crucial importance to know what strategies should be adopted by the healthcare organizations and institutions, taking into account the decision-making criteria in the basis of the decision-making process of the health service providers.

Chapter three focuses on preparation of an integrated marketing plan and program in health. The integrated healthcare marketing program is developed to determine how the defined value is to be delivered to the users of the healthcare services. The marketing program in healthcare determines the ways healthcare organizations build relationships with their patients by turning the marketing strategy into specific marketing activities.

Chapter four focuses on achieving consumer value in healthcare. Consumers play a critical role in the medical decision-making process, making choices that ultimately impact the value of care delivered on both individual and societal levels. Quality, cost, and coverage are inextricably linked and all must be addressed in order for a healthcare system that delivers quality and affordable healthcare for all to be achieved.

Contributions and significance of development for science and practice

The problem posed by **Angelco Andonovski** is interdisciplinary and entirely refers to the current achievements and needs of science and practice, which deserves to appreciate the author's contribution. The chosen research problem is not an easy problem to study due to its interdisciplinary and multifaceted nature. ‘

In the course of scientific research, which demonstrates the potential of scientific contributions:

1. The methods for implementing the policy for the application of marketing in healthcare have been researched and empirically proven.
2. Research was conducted to improve coordination and cooperation between the individual sectors in health care and health organizations

3. Proposal for successful management of marketing in health care and in separate health organizations.
4. A model of a system of measures and activities is proposed for the successful implementation of marketing in health organizations, both at the level of organizations and at the level of the health system.
5. Proposed activities for using marketing as a tool and business policy of health organizations and the health care system.
6. Proposal for the improvement of separate instruments of marketing in health organizations, and among manufacturers of medical services and products.
7. Developed measures to improve the use of marketing as a business function of the operation of health entities.
8. Proposed and devised activities for the promotion of the business activities of healthcare organizations with the application of marketing in healthcare.

6. Evaluation of dissertation publications

The results of the scientific research are reflected in 3 publications prepared independently. They testify to the doctoral student's long-standing and deep scientific interest in tax issues and the fact that the prepared dissertation is the author's work.

7. Assessment of compliance with the minimum national requirements

Attached is a Certificate for fulfillment by the doctoral student of the minimum national requirements for acquiring the educational and scientific degree "Doctor" in the professional field 3.8. Economics. The total number of points is many times higher than required.

8. Assessment of the applicant's personal contribution

The presented dissertation on: "**Role of marketing in the creation of financial resources in healthcare organizations**" is the result of scientific research confirmed by constructive results. There is no doubt about the author's contribution, in-depth scientific research, and pursuit of the set goal and research hypotheses.

The dissertation demonstrates the author's theoretical knowledge and proves his ability to conduct scientific work independently.

Summary of professional accomplishments

The summary of professional accomplishments consisting of 36 pages, has been prepared following the requirements of LDAS and RILDAS. It is structurally correct and adequately reflects the dissertation's logic, consistency, and contributions. It demonstrates **Angelco Andonovski's** skills in synthesizing and summarizing her most essential ideas and conclusions.

9. Critical comments and recommendations

My critical notes to the presented dissertation work of **Angelco Andonovski** are the following:

The dissertation would benefit from a clearer definition of subject and object, as well as clearer argumentation of rather exposed theses and propositions.

The restrictive conditions in the developed dissertation not clearly defined.

Also, this kind of scientific research implies more financial and economic analysis of data, statistical information, comparison and contrast, generalizations, models and original contributions to the studied issues.

The pages referenced in the table of contents do not match.

In modern scientific publications, citation under a line is unacceptable.

I can make some remarks regarding the bibliography, as it mainly uses internet sources. There are no sources from scientific journals, articles and studies, monographs, and there are no publications by leading scientists with IF/IR.

Almost all of the cited sources have incomplete and inaccurate bibliographic descriptions, pages are missing, not all cited sources are cited in the text (113/ 123)

I also cannot accept the citing of textbooks as a source in scientific research as the main bibliography; they are more of educational, not scientific literature.

I recommend presenting the results in specialized international publications with IF / IR, allowing higher visibility of scientific results and creating conditions for more intensive citations.

Participation in international scientific conferences and preferential publication in English will lead to greater recognition in scientific circles and popularization of scientific research.

10. Personal impressions

I do not know the doctoral student personally. We do not have joint publications and developments.

My impressions come from the dissertation, the author's summary of professional accomplishments, and dissertation publications. They show a serious and erudite researcher, a bona fide scientist with an extensive theoretical background and a proven ability for independent research.

CONCLUSION

The dissertation contains scientific, scientific-applied, and applied results, representing an original contribution to science and meeting all the requirements (s) of LDASRB and RILDASRB. The presented materials and dissertation results correspond to the specific requirements of the Regulations for admission and training doctoral students at the Higher School of Insurance and Finance.

The dissertation shows that **Angelco Andonovski** has in-depth theoretical knowledge and professional skills in the Professional field 3. 8. Economics, demonstrating qualities and skills for independent research.

Due to the above, I give my positive assessment of the research presented by the above-reviewed dissertation, a summary of professional accomplishments, results, and contributions, and I invite the scientific jury to award the educational and scientific degree "Doctor" to **Angelco Andonovski** in the field of higher education 3. Social, economic, and legal sciences; Professional field 3. 8. Economics; Ph.D. program "Finance, Insurance and Social Security".

05.01.2025

REVIEWER: 

/prof. Mariana Petrova, PhD/