

STANDPOINT

by Assos. Prof. Martin Vasilev Zahariev, PhD University of Library Studies and Information Technologies (ULSIT), Faculty of Information Sciences, Department of National Security, Professional Field: 3.5. Public Communications and Information Sciences

for dissertation for awarding the educational and scientific degree “**Doctor**” in the field of higher education 3. Social, economic, and legal sciences, Professional field 3.8. Economics

Author: PANAR ERDINCH KYAZIM

Topic: “INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT SYSTEM”

1. General description of the presented materials

By Order No. 90 dated 05.04.2022 of the Rector of the Higher School of Insurance and Finance (VUZF) Prof. ScD Boris Velchev, I have been appointed a member of the scientific jury to ensure the procedure for the defense of a dissertation on “**Intellectual Property Financial Management System**” for the acquisition of educational and scientific degree “**Doctor**” in the field of higher education 3. Social, economic, and legal sciences, Professional field 3.8. Economics. The author of the dissertation is Panar Erdinch Kyazim – a doctoral student in an independent form of study at VUZF.

The materials submitted by Panar Kyazim include documents according to the presented inventory list: CV; reference of the implementation of the minimum national requirements for the acquisition of the scientific degree “**Doctor**”; summary of the publications presented. The doctoral student has also attached **4 publications**, published in non-referenced journals with a scientific review, as follows: (1) “Generating positive financial result from IP exploitation”, *The International Journal of Business and Management*, Vol. 4, Issue 1, January – February 2020, pp 17-22, (2) “The Challenge Called ‘Intellectual Property Management’”, *Money and*

Culture, Issue 2, 2020, pp 100-105, (3) “Intellectual Property Management as Part of the Knowledge Economy”, *Економіка харчової промисловості*, Vol. 11, Alumni 4/2019, pp 65-70, (4) “Consideration of Intellectual Property Insurance Essence”, *Economics of Enterprises. Macroeconomics*, Vol. 1 No. 4(63) (2022); **dissertation; abstract in Bulgarian and English.** The documents are presented in a digital format in PDF/EXCEL format.

2. Brief biographical information of the candidate

Panar Kyazim has received a Bachelor’s and then a Master’s degree, in both “Economics and Intellectual Property” and “Marketing”, (the Master’s degrees have been acquired in the years 2008 and 2010, respectively), at the University of National and World Economy (UNWE). The rich academic profile of the doctoral student is complemented by the acquisition of the degree “Specialist” of European Economic Integration (elective) at UNWE (2008) and a Teaching Qualification Specialisation at Sofia University “St. Kliment Ohridski” – Department of Information and In-Service Training of Teachers (2021). She has a good command of multiple languages, among which Turkish and English. In the period September 2008 to January 2011, Panar Kyazim was a part-time Lecturer of the subject “Intellectual Property” at UNWE. What is noteworthy from Panar Kyazim’s professional experience is the fact that she has worked for over 2 years as a specialist in Industrial Property at “MS Partners” Law Firm, and over 3 years as a specialist in “Copyright” at “NAR” Ltd., where she is a manager to this moment. From the presented biographic report, it is apparent that the doctoral student has a rich practical experience in matters of intellectual property (IP) protection, combined with an active teaching practice. This rarely witnessed combination allows for the doctoral student to formulate contributions with a clear practical application.

3. Characteristics and evaluation of the dissertation

The dissertation is of 229 pages and its structure consists of an introduction, three chapters, a conclusion, scientific contributions, literature used, and attachments. 12 figures, 2 tables, and 3 graphs are presented. 164 information sources are used, in different languages. The introduction formulates the object and subject of research, the restrictions of the research, the purpose of the research and the working hypothesis, and specific scientific research tasks and methods are defined. Chapter one synthesises the theoretical foundation on which the IP

financial management system is based, namely its legal, financial-accounting, and management aspect. As the doctoral student herself states, the “statistics” of the IP financial management is analysed. Through the analysis in chapter one, the doctoral student has formulated fact-based conclusions, which constitute a necessary step towards proving her thesis and basis for the research in the next chapters. The second chapter reviews the IP financial management in its “dynamic”, i.e. the functional aspect of this management. This chapter contains important contributions for the overall research, as in it for the first time the author formulates a structure, on which the IP financial management system to be effectively built and implemented. This structure includes an audit, a SWOT analysis, and a valuation of IP objects, as well as a subsequent definition of strategies for IP financial management. Undoubtedly, I personally found the third chapter most interesting, where the proposed IP financial management system is approbated on a commercial enterprise, actually existing and operating on the market. In this chapter, the doctoral student conducts innovative empirical research and in this way proves that the proposed in chapter two system is in fact applicable, and its approbation is possible under various limitations. The conclusion summarises the most significant parts of the research and important inferences are made in support of the thesis, based on the results accomplished in the different chapters. The dissertation is written in a clear and logical sequence, while a considerable part of the sources used are in a foreign language – a demonstration of the high competence level of the doctoral student in matters of IP. The dissertation is a solid basis for future research in the field of financial aspects of IP management.

4. Contributions and significance of development for science and practice

The dissertation “INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT SYSTEM” represents an independent, original, and complete piece of scientific research. The research hypothesis that the introduction of an IP financial management system can optimise the financial flows that IP objects generate in a company is indisputably proved, including by way of approbation of the results given by the proposed financial management system, in a specific, actually functioning enterprise in the country. The scientific research tasks conditioned by the author are accomplished in full degree. Among the more significant theoretical contributions, I would single out: the systematising of a theoretical basis, upon which steps the IP financial management system; the formulation of a new IP financial management

structure, comprising of three interconnected management aspects namely, legal, financial-accounting, and management; the systematising of different IP financial management strategies. Undoubtedly important contributions of practical application are the IP financial management system model and the approbation of the IP financial management system, developed by the author. Due to its relevance, the researched problem and the proposed IP financial management system have reasonable development prospects.

5. Evaluation of dissertation publications

The doctoral student has presented four publications – articles, published in non-referenced journals with scientific reviews (their exact titles are listed under item 1 of the current standpoint). All of them are prepared independently and not in co-authorship. Three of them are in English, one is in Bulgarian. All four presented publications reflect the theories and problems examined in the dissertation. The insurance of IP, how to generate a positive financial result from the IP object exploitation, and the economic challenges facing the IP management in the current economics of knowledge are examined. Those are all aspects of an IP financial management system, that have found a specific reflection in the dissertation research.

6. Assessment for the fulfillment of the minimum national requirements

As it is made obvious from the presented reference, the candidate **has fulfilled** the minimum national requirements necessary for the acquisition of the educational and scientific degree “Doctor”, in the Professional field 3.8. Economics.

7. Abstract

The presented by the doctoral candidate abstract is prepared in accordance with the established practice and requirements for an academic abstract. It reflects the basic results achieved in the dissertation precisely and correctly. The abstract presents the dissertation in an organised, structured, and clear voice. The doctoral student has skillfully and in a synthesised manner presented the object and the results of the conducted research, as well as the results and significance of the conclusions, in view of proving the thesis.

8. Critical comments and recommendations

Despite the indisputable merits of the dissertation, a few critical remarks and recommendations could be formulated, as follows:

1. I recommend that the doctoral student expands her object of scientific research in the future, by covering the rest of the IP divisions unexplored in the dissertation – copyright and related rights, geographical indications, plant and animal varieties, topology of integral circuits, domain names etc. Especially considering the fact that once arisen, copyright is non-transferable, but only granting its subsequent use is permissible, it would be interesting and useful to observe how the doctoral student adapts the proposed IP financial management model in the company under this specific IP object.
2. I recommend that the doctoral student publishes her dissertation shortly, in the form of a monograph, as such work would undoubtedly be relevant and of an important practical significance for the Bulgarian companies.
3. The accomplishment of a trade secret protection does not limit itself only to the signing of the appropriate confidentiality agreements (e.g., see p. 140 of the dissertation), rather it supposes the implementation of complex and effective measures for the storage and safe-keeping of the respective information in confidence – e.g., with the use of technical, organisational, legal, security, and other methods. Confidentiality agreements are one of the possible but by far not the only appropriate measure in this direction.
4. The term “practicing of rights” (p. 198 of the dissertation), from purely legal perspective, sounds imprecise; I recommend that it is changed to “exercising of rights” or another similar expression, established in the legal theory and practice.
5. As much as it is traditionally accepted that recipes are not suitable for being object of copyright, it is debatable whether their licensing is possible, as the doctoral student proposes (p. 199 of the dissertation). I recommend a more precise manner of expressing this part and a specification of whether the author refers to some kind of franchise agreement, know-how sharing agreement and the like.

The above critical remarks are formulated only for the purpose of scientific precision and increase of the quality of the work in light of its possible subsequent publication as a monograph and future scientific research of the doctoral student, in these matters. In no way do they change

the overall **excellent impression** that the dissertation and the accompanying publications have left on me.

CONCLUSION

The dissertation **comprises of scientific, scientific-applied and applied results, which represent an original contribution to science and meet all** of the requirements of Law for the Development of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria (LDASRB) and the Regulations for its implementation (RILDASRB). The presented materials and dissertation results **fully** correspond to the specific requirements of the Regulations for admission and training of doctoral students at the Higher School of Insurance and Finance.

The dissertation shows that the candidate Panar Erdinch Kyazim **holds** in-depth theoretical knowledge and professional skills in Professional field 3. 8. Economics, **demonstrating** the qualities and skills necessary to conduct independent research.

Due to the above, I give my **positive assessment** of the conducted research, presented by the above reviewed dissertation, abstract, reached results and contributions, and ***I invite the honourable scientific jury to award the educational and scientific degree "Doctor"*** to Panar Erdinch Kyazim in the field of higher education 3. Social, economic and legal sciences; Professional field 3. 8. Economics.

11.05.2022

Reviewer: Assos. Prof. Martin Zahariev, PhD